When Prone Restraint Becomes Risky: What Really Drives Breathing Trouble

Geoffrey Desmoulin (Ph.D., R.Kin., P.L.Eng.)
GTD Scientific Inc.

Source Article

Milner, T. E., & Desmoulin, G. T. (2025). Physiology and biomechanics of prone restraint respiration. *Medicine, Science and the Law, 65*(4), 311-320. https://doi.org/10.1177/00258024251348719

Take Home Messages

- In calm, cooperative people, being prone (even with typical restraint) usually changes breathing only slightly; serious problems are more likely when several risk factors stack up.

- The biggest danger signal is often carbon dioxide (CO_2) build-up from high effort, stress, or drugs, especially when chest or belly movement is restricted.

- Reducing struggle time, avoiding added weight on the back, and rapidly reassessing breathing can meaningfully lower risk during restraint.

When Prone Restraint Becomes Risky: What Really Drives Breathing Trouble

Why did the researchers conduct the study?

Deaths during or after restraint have led to public concern that the prone position may stop someone from breathing. The authors of the source article wrote their review to separate what is known from controlled studies (usually calm volunteers) from what happens in real encounters (often anxious, exhausted, intoxicated, or obese individuals). Their core question was practical: If someone deteriorates while prone-restrained, is the likely breathing problem low oxygen, CO_2 build-up, or something else?

How did the researchers conduct the study?

The source article was a review article. The authors pulled together results from prior research on:

- How breathing differs when a person is upright versus lying prone.
- What happens to breathing when the chest or abdomen is restricted by positioning, restraint, or added weight.
- How much physical effort (struggling), larger body size, panic/anxiety, and common intoxicants change breathing demands and the body's ability to clear CO_2.

The authors focused on how these factors interact, because a person in a police encounter may face more than one of these factors at the same time.

What did the researchers find?

Several important findings emerged from the review:

1. Prone position alone is usually not enough to "shut down" breathing in calm people. Across multiple laboratory-style studies, the average changes in breathing volumes and oxygen measures were generally small when subjects were cooperative.[1]
2. The situation changes when breathing demand rises. A person who is actively resisting can produce far more CO_2 and needs higher airflow to clear it. If the chest wall and belly cannot move freely, the person may not be able to "blow off" the extra CO_2 even if oxygen levels look acceptable at first.[2]
3. Added restriction (especially weight on the torso) can remove breathing "reserve." Studies that simulate police arrest with thoracic loading show reduced ability to take deeper breaths during recovery after exertion, which is exactly when a struggling person most needs breathing capacity.[3]
4. Body size matters. Larger body mass can reduce resting lung volume and increase the effort required to move air, especially when prone. This does not mean an obese person cannot breathe while prone, but it means they may have less margin for error when exertion, stress, or restraint is added.[4]
5. Panic/anxiety and drugs can push the system in opposite directions that both increase risk. Severe anxiety and panic can cause rapid, inefficient breathing and make a person feel like they cannot get air, which can accelerate struggle and exhaustion. Opioids can slow breathing and reduce airflow, while stimulants can raise heart rate and disrupt normal body reflexes that help manage CO_2 changes.[5]

Overall, the authors argue that if respiratory collapse happens during prone restraint, it is more likely to be driven by CO_2 build-up (hypercapnia) than by low oxygen alone. In plain terms: a person may still have oxygen in their blood, but may be failing to clear CO_2 fast enough, which can worsen confusion, agitation, and eventually heart function.[6]

Table 1. Key Factors that Can Stack Together to Create Breathing Trouble During Restraint

Factor	What the factor tends to do	Practical meaning in an arrest
Active resistance /struggle	Greatly increases CO_2 production and breathing demand	Long struggles raise risk even if position is unchanged
Chest or back loading	Limits chest expansion and reduces "deep breath" reserve	Avoid kneeling / weight on torso; move to recovery posture ASAP
Abdominal restriction (belly pressure)	Makes diaphragm movement harder	Watch for belt, body weight, or positioning that compresses abdomen
Large body size	Lower baseline breathing reserve; higher effort to breathe prone	Lower tolerance for added restriction after exertion
Opioids /sedatives	Slow breathing and reduce airflow	Higher need for early medical response and monitoring
Stimulants /extreme panic	Higher effort, faster CO_2 build-up, poor coordination	De-escalate early; shorten restraint duration

How can the police use these findings?

The police can use these findings in various ways:

- Treat prone restraint as a time-limited control position, not a holding position. The longer the struggle and restraint period, the more likely CO_2 build-up becomes a problem.
- Avoid adding weight to the person's back or torso. If stabilization is required, prioritize techniques that control limbs without compressing the chest or abdomen.
- Prioritize rapid recovery positioning once control is achieved. After exertion, people need room to take deeper breaths; moving to a seated or side-lying recovery posture can restore breathing reserve.
- Watch for red flags that suggest rising breathing demand or poor CO_2 clearance: extreme agitation, fast shallow breathing, inability to speak normally, sudden quietness after intense struggle, or worsening confusion.
- Recognize high-risk combinations: prolonged resistance + obesity + chest/abdominal restriction, or any resistance combined with opioid intoxication or stimulant-driven agitation.
- Build checks into your workflow: early request for medical support when risk factors are present, and repeated reassessment of breathing and responsiveness during and after restraint.

References

1. Chan, T. C., Vilke, G. M., Neuman, T., & Clausen, J. L. (1997). Restraint position and positional asphyxia. *Annals of Emergency Medicine, 30*(5), 578–586. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0196-0644(97)70072-6
2. Michalewicz, B. A., Chan, T. C., Vilke, G. M., Levy, S. S., Neuman, T. S., & Kolkhorst, F. W. (2007). Ventilatory and metabolic demands during aggressive physical restraint in healthy adults. *Journal of Forensic Sciences, 52*(1), 171–175. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1556-4029.2006.00296.x
3. Campbell, M., Dakin, R., Stowe, S., & Stockwell, T. (2021). Thoracic weighting of restrained subjects during exhaustion recovery causes loss of lung reserve volume in a model of police arrest. *Scientific Reports, 11*, 15166. https://doi-org/10.1038/s41598-021-94157-w
4. Sloane, C., Chan, T. C., Kolkhorst, F. W., Neuman, T. S., & Vilke, G. M. (2014). Evaluation of the ventilatory effects of the prone maximum restraint position on obese human subjects. *Forensic Science International, 237*, 86–89. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.forsciint.2014.01.017
5. Palkovic, B., Marchenko, V., Zuperku, E. J., Stuth, E. A. E., & Hopp, F. A. (2020). Multi-level regulation of opioid-induced respiratory depression. *Physiology, 35*(5), 391–404. https://doi.org/10.1152/physiol.00015.2020
6. Steinberg, A. (2021). Prone restraint cardiac arrest: A comprehensive review of the scientific literature and an explanation of the physiology. *Medicine, Science and the Law, 61*(3), 215–226. https://doi.org/10.1177/00258024211020460